

Green Procurement Policies and Actions Scan

March 2012



Report to the Clean Air Council



Prepared by the Clean Air Partnership

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preamble	3
About the Clean Air Council	4
About the Green Procurement Community of Practice and Purpose of the Green Procurement Policies and Actions Scan	6
About the Green/Sustainable Procurement Policies/Procedures/Actions Scan	9
About Green/Sustainable Procurement	10
Clean Air Council Green /Sustainable Procurement Policies/Procedures/Actions	11
Non CAC Canadian Municipal Green/Sustainable Policies/Procedures/Actions	30
Canadian Provincial Green/Sustainable Policies/Procedures/Actions	35
Unites States Municipal/State Green/Sustainable Policies/Procedures/Actions	36
Green/Sustainable Purchasing Networks	37
Additional Green/Sustainable Purchasing Resources Summary	39
Clean Air Council Green Procurement Intranet Resources	39

Preamble

Acknowledgments

Clean Air Partnership (CAP) would like to thank the members of the Clean Air Council and the Green Procurement Community of Practice for their financial support, as well as their content, input, time and thoughtful reflections on this material. CAP would also like to acknowledge the ongoing support of the City of Toronto and the Toronto Atmospheric Fund.

About the Clean Air Partnership

Clean Air Partnership (CAP) is a registered charity that works in partnership to promote and coordinate actions to improve local air quality and reduce greenhouse gases for healthy communities. Our applied research on municipal policies strives to broaden and improve access to public policy debate on air pollution and climate change issues. Our social marketing programs focus on energy conservation activities that motivate individuals, government, schools, utilities, businesses and communities to take action to clean the air and protect the climate.

Clean Air Partnership's mission is to transform cities into sustainable, vibrant, resilient communities, where the air is clean to breathe and greenhouse gas emissions are minimized.

© Clean Air Partnership, 2012. All rights reserved.

For more information, contact:

Clean Air Partnership
75 Elizabeth Street
Toronto, Ontario M5G 1P4
Canada
416-392-6672

www.cleanairpartnership.org

cap@cleanairpartnership.org

About the Clean Air Council

Origins of the Clean Air Council

In 2000 the Ontario Medical Association (OMA) declared air pollution "**a public health crisis.**" This statement was based on strong scientific evidence linking air pollutants like ozone, nitrogen oxides, carbon monoxide and tiny airborne particulates and acid droplets to various illnesses and breathing problems. According to the OMA's report, [The Illness Cost of Air Pollution in Ontario](#), particulate matter (one type of air pollution) is responsible for almost 5,800 premature deaths per year (2005 updated numbers) in Ontario and almost half a billion dollars in health care costs (not including visits to family doctors) and lost productivity (as employees were too sick to come to work due to smog).

Climate change is the **most pressing environmental, social and economic problem facing the planet.** The consequences of climate change are global and long-term. The synergies between the actions that address air pollution and climate change enable communities to address the two problems with common solutions. Southern Ontario is where the majority of Ontario residents live and it is where the majority of energy is used. The creation of lower carbon communities that are more efficient, livable, sustainable and resilient are one of the main tools that will enable us to tackle the air pollution and climate change challenge.

In order to take action on air pollution and climate change, in 2000 CAP and the City of Toronto organized the first Smog Summit to explore solutions to the clean air and climate change problem. Based on the success and benefits of working via governmental and regional partnerships to address air pollution and energy use, the GTA Clean Air Council (GTA CAC) was launched at the 2001 Smog Summit. Based on the outcomes and benefits of working collaboratively in the GTA, municipalities in Southwestern Ontario formed their own Clean Air Council in 2008 (SWO CAC). The GTA and the SWO CAC work collaboratively and individually to ensure a balance between sharing experiences and learnings across regions while still retaining enough flexibility to ensure regional issues and opportunities are addressed.

The Greater Toronto Area (GTA) and Southwestern Ontario (SWO) Clean Air Councils (CAC) promotes the reduction of air pollution and greenhouse gas emissions and increased awareness of regional air quality and climate change issues through the collective efforts of all levels of government. The Councils identify and promote effective initiatives to reduce the occurrence of air pollution and greenhouse gas emissions in the GTA and SWO, and their associated health risks. The Clean Air Councils work on the very simple premise that if one jurisdiction undertakes a clean air/climate change action that it makes sense to share their experience and lessons learned with other jurisdictions. In

this way it helps to promote and raise the bar for the implementation of actions that will lead us to lower carbon and more healthy and livable communities.

There are many benefits to a collaborative approach to addressing air quality and climate change issues. Having multiple jurisdictions at the same table enhances networking and the exchange of resources and information. It ensures that no one group is working in isolation and that those efforts are not unnecessarily duplicated. Inter-governmental and inter-regional cooperation also provides an opportunity to leverage scarce resources for research, outreach and other air quality improvement initiatives. Bringing together multiple staff from different departments and municipalities across the airshed also helps break down silos that may exist within and amongst municipalities, and increases cooperation on air quality and climate change issues.

Clean Air Council Mandate

- To enable solutions to air quality and climate change challenges through a dynamic network that expands knowledge and enthusiasm, and encourages practical and successful policies and actions;
- To promote a better understanding of air quality and climate change problems and their implications for public health among policy makers and to improve their ability to address these problems in an economically effective way;
- To explore opportunities for joint initiatives to reduce air pollution and greenhouse gas emissions in the GTA and SWO;
- To develop and report on progress of Inter-governmental Declarations on Clean Air and Climate Change;
- To track and monitor the implementation and transfer of clean air and climate change actions across the jurisdictions; and
- To liaise with municipalities in the GTA, SWO and Canada and internationally, and organizations with compatible mandates to share best practices for reducing air pollution and greenhouse gas emissions.

Clean Air Council Goals

- Develop and promote a Resilient Region¹ vision;
- Identify and maximize synergies between clean air, health and climate change actions and improvements in community livability and resilience;
- Identify financing and business case opportunities to move actions from pilot stage to business as usual and contribute to the building of the emerging green economy;

¹ A Resilient Region is defined as “A region that has developed capacities to help absorb future shocks and stresses (ex. population, climate change, energy scarcity, environmental degradation, income disparity, socio-political) to its social, economic, and technical systems and infrastructures so as to still be able to maintain essentially the same functions, structures, systems, and identity.” Source: ResilientCity.org

- Share lessons learned on the implementation of actions and report on the uptake/transfer/consistency of those actions across the region; and
- Identify new opportunities being undertaken elsewhere and applicable/supportive of movement towards the Resilient Region vision in the GTA and Southern Ontario.

About the Clean Air Partnership

Clean Air Partnership serves as the secretariat for the GTA and the Southwestern Ontario Clean Air Council, facilitates and supports additional networks such as the Alliance for Resilient Cities and North South Climate Change Network, and participates in numerous others networks including but not limited to the Ontario Regional Adaptation Collaborative, Community Adaptation Initiative, and AMO's Energy Management and Climate Change Task Force, and FCM's Sustainable Communities and Green Municipal Fund.

About the Green Procurement Community of Practice and Purpose of the Green Procurement Policies and Actions Scan

About the Green Procurement Community of Practice

Since 2008, CAC jurisdictions have committed to work collaboratively to reduce energy use in government buildings and operations and to establish a Community of Practice (COP) to increase the implementation of environmental criteria in purchasing, lease and contract decisions in their respective corporations. In 2009, CAC jurisdictions extended the mandate and established the Green Procurement Community of Practice.

The Green Procurement COP (GP COP) provides a forum for government purchasing staff to: regularly share environmental procurement knowledge, research, and experience; build capacity for green purchasing; pilot likely strategies; and promote the most successful strategies within their organizations.

The main objective of the GP COP is to connect experts and practitioners and create a collaborative and cooperative learning environment. The peer-to-peer environment of a COP provides:

- An opportunity to share interests and experiences that will generate useful and practical advice;
- An opportunity for participants to seek information to solve immediate problems;
- An opportunity to pool research needs; and
- The ability to document procedures, activities and benefits of green/sustainable policy implementation and share experiences and lessons learned in the implementation of green/sustainable procurement actions and measures.

The goal of the GP COP is to build a supportive network that will enhance the ability of CAC member jurisdictions and staff to support each other's efforts to develop and adopt green procurement policies and incorporate green criteria and policies into purchasing decisions. The GP COP will enable participants to share information, research, experiences, lessons learned, and collaborate on barriers and problem solving.

In 2009 and 2010 the GP COP focused on highlighting lessons learned and experiences from jurisdictions across the GTA, Ontario and Canada who have developed Green Procurement Policies and/or Procedures. These lessons learned, experiences and resources were shared via meetings and webinars and participants requested the development of a Toolkit where all the resources could be brought into one place and template green procurement outreach materials could be developed and shared.

- The online Toolkit can be accessed at:
http://www.cleanairpartnership.org/intranet_gp-cop_toolkit
- The overall Green Procurement Intranet can be accessed at:
http://www.cleanairpartnership.org/intranet_gp-cop
- It is password protected, for your jurisdictions username and password contact Gabriella at gkalapos@cleanairpartnership.org

2011 Green Purchasing COP Activities

Webinars of Green Procurement Policies/Procedures and Activities

In 2011 CAP focused on organizing webinar presentations by jurisdictions to share the actions they are undertaking that achieves energy efficiency and environmentally preferable purchases. Participants ask presenters questions and sought their guidance on factors they are dealing with in their jurisdiction. In addition, CAP worked to identify and collaborate with partners (Municipal Collaboration for Sustainable Purchasing, Greening Greater Toronto, Partners in Project Green, Responsible Purchasing Network, etc.) to share resources and lessons learned.

Presentations are not limited simply to Green Procurement Policies/Procedures but seek to share experience and expertise associated with the implementation of Green Procurement actions in specific areas. It is difficult enough to figure out the “more environmentally preferable choice” in one product area, never mind all the different areas of products and services purchased. So the goal is to have all the Clean Air Council jurisdictions share their experiences and lessons learned in a variety of areas where they have implemented green procurement actions. CAP then documents the experience and expertise around the region, works with Green Procurement COP participants to identify gaps and ask jurisdictions to self identify responsibility across the region for developing the experiences and expertise in the missing areas so that each jurisdiction would only

have to take on a limited area but all the resources and lessons learned would be shared across the region.

Green Procurement Webinars (http://www.cleanairpartnership.org/intranet_gp-cop_meetings)

- November 8, 2011: Sustainable Procurement Actions, Experiences and Lessons Learned - Town of Oakville and Town of Markham
- September 29th, 2011: Sustainable Procurement Networks
- May 12, 2011: Responsible Purchasing Network: Compostable Service Ware
- April 12, 2011: York Region Green Power Purchasing and E-Procurement Actions, Opportunities and Plans
- March 29, 2011: Oshawa Cleaning Products and Brampton Green Procurement Activities
- March 23, 2011: Green Procurement and Energy Star Opportunities and Resources
- March 8, 2011: 2011 Green Procurement Workplan and Greening Paper Purchases

Green procurement presentations planned for 2012 include but are not limited to: Life Cycle Costing, Clinton Foundation; Ryerson University and OPG Supplier Code of Conduct; Halton Region Local Food, International Centre Local Food, E-Procurement; Aggregate Recycling, Responsible Purchasing Network.

Longer Term Green Procurement COP Activities

Development of a Monitoring and Reporting Protocol to Track Progress on Green Procurement Decisions and Outcomes (Long-Term Goal)

In order to monitor and track progress towards the development and implementation of green procurement policies and practices, a system needs to be developed that would enable the jurisdictions to track their progress in a consistent manner across the region. CAP developed a draft survey and will be seeking input from a steering committee to ensure that the survey collects pertinent and useful information over the short and long term.

[Link to draft Monitoring and Reporting Survey](#)

Delivery of Ongoing Green Purchasing Progress Reports (Long-Term Goal)

The goal will be to use the above survey to undertake (biennial) progress reports to track green procurement outcomes and progress.

About the Green/Sustainable Procurement Policies/Procedures/Actions Scan

On June 3, 2009, the GTA CAC member municipalities signed on to the **Toronto and Region Inter-Governmental Declaration on Clean Air**, committing them to take action on clean air and climate change. The Declaration calls on the signatories to:

Develop corporate Green Procurement Policies that increase the implementation of energy efficiency criteria in purchasing, lease and contract decisions.

Update: Approved Green Procurement Policies/Procedures: Burlington, Brampton (Energy Star and EcoChoice label criteria); Hamilton (life cycle costing policy); Oakville; Pickering; Toronto.

Green Procurement Policies in Progress: Caledon, Halton Region, Region of Peel, Markham, Mississauga, Oshawa, Richmond Hill, Vaughan, Whitby, and York Region.

Green Procurement Practices in Place: One of the most common obstacles municipalities face in regards to green procurement is the challenge of identifying how to implement green procurement policies. Many municipal purchasing and other departments feel overwhelmed by how best to select the “environmentally preferable choice” in one area of purchasing must less in all the categories that need to be purchased. The purpose of this scan is to document green procurement actions being undertaken, share experiences and lessons learned, identify gaps so that each of the jurisdictions in the GP COP can volunteer to take on the research and develop expertise in one of the gap areas and then share them with all the other jurisdictions in the network and beyond. This will enable all municipalities in the GP COP to further their development and implementation goals in a much more efficient and effective manner.

This report is a summary of the webinars, presentations and roundtables and is not comprehensive. The goal of this report is to provide CAC members with preliminary information, to share actions and lessons learned by CAC member jurisdictions and to solicit additional information from CAC jurisdictions. Please provide additional information or edits via email to **Gabriella Kalapos** at gkalapos@cleanairpartnership.org.

The Clean Air Council has a series of scans that tracks clean air and climate change declaration actions. See below for a listing of the various [CAC scans](#).

- [Land Use and Public Health Resources](#)
- [Local Food Procurement Actions and Reports Scan](#)
- [Green Energy Purchasing Scan](#)
- [Green Energy Production Scan](#)
- [Green Development Target Scan](#)

- [Clean Air and Climate Change Action Plans \(GTA CAC\) Scan](#)
- [South Western Ontario Clean Air Plans Scan June 2010 Draft](#)
- [Bicycle and Pedestrian Scan](#)
- [Urban Forestry Scan](#)
- [GTA CAC 2010 -2011 Declaration Prioritization Results](#)
- [2010 GTA CAC Declaration](#)
- [2008 - 2010 CAC Declaration Progress Report](#)

Clean Air Partnership is in the process of developing the following scan:

- [Monitoring and Reporting on Action Plan Implementation](#)

About Green/Sustainable Procurement

Through their purchases, governments, corporations, universities, and other large institutions wield significant influence over the future of our planet. Nearly every purchase an institution makes, from office paper to buildings, has hidden costs for the natural environment and the world's people. Shifting even a fraction of institutional spending away from harmful goods and services to more environmentally friendly alternatives can benefit ecosystems and communities as well as save money. Green purchasing can also send a powerful message to the market, showing manufacturers that institutional consumers of all kinds increasingly demand more sustainable options.

According to the Association of Municipalities of Ontario (AMO), the buying power of Ontario municipalities is more than 30 billion dollars. In addition, a recent AMO report found that municipalities consume 6.6 billion kWh of electricity per year, second largest sectoral consumers of electricity after pulp and paper mills. The Clean Air Partnership has been working over the last four years to promote the benefits of municipal energy conservation opportunities to CAC jurisdictions. A particular emphasis has been placed on encouraging municipalities to incorporate energy efficiency criteria into purchasing decisions. Over the last few years CAC jurisdictions have identified 'Green Purchasing' as a priority action. Green purchasing requires that environmental criteria (ex. energy efficiency), be considered along with other criteria such as price, reliability and quality when making all purchasing decisions and when allocating contracts.

But there is still a long way to go. Few governments and organizations realize the tremendous potential of their purchasing to effect positive environmental change. Spreading the movement isn't easy. Many political, legal, institutional and other hurdles prevent them from effectively harnessing this potential. Identifying and promoting effective policies/procedures and actions to achieve this goal may be one of the powerful tools available for shifting patterns of production and consumption in a more sustainable

direction. In addition, we need to track progress; share success and lessons learned and report on environmental and financial benefits achieved.

Clean Air Council Green /Sustainable Procurement Policies/Procedures/Actions

Town of Aurora

- Some environmental purchasing considerations are factored into Aurora's Corporate Environmental Action Plan. Aurora is working to update its procurement policy to include environmental and sustainability considerations. Greening fleet is another priority area for 2012.
- Facilities manager renegotiated the service contracts for all Town facilities committing cleaning contractors to use green products and practices. This service was offered in the running for the contract so it did not cost any more. The Town is planning to promote the use of green products to staff by putting stickers on mirrors.
- To reduce paper use, a number of directors have requested that council reports be digitalized. Over time Aurora will endeavor to have council receive reports digitally as well.

City of Brampton

Policy and Implementation

- **Revised Purchasing Bylaw** is currently under review and is scheduled for approval in early 2012. The objective of this Policy to promote procurement processes and decisions which are consistent with the strategic objectives of the City, including preservation of the natural environment; waste reduction and recycling; co-operative purchasing, where beneficial; and the support of local and Canadian business and industry when possible, provided that the objective of this Policy and the requirements of any applicable international or inter-provincial trade agreements are not compromised.
- **Environmental Master Plan** is being developed and will include recommendations to develop greening procurement protocols.
- Focused on third party certification of ENERGY STAR, Ecologo, Green Seal, CSA Standards and others.

Building and Facility Management

- **Janitorial Service and Cleaning:** External service contract groups manage the contracts for 120 various city wide facilities. The purchasing policy allows us to provide green specifications in the contract language. The contract language ranges from a broad overview statement to provide a framework, to specific specifications.

- **Janitorial Service and Cleaning:** cleaning products are Green Seal certified, paper products are 100% recycled; hand and body soaps are GreenLogo certified; whether it is internal or external janitorial service providers they are required to use standardized certified products. There are no products for specific sites; it is a city wide standard.

Lighting and Energy Management

- Have focused on HID lighting equipment, have seen sizable reductions of 25-38%; piloting LED installation in targeted areas and getting very encouraging results; light harvesting is also being used, and in current building entire floor has light harvesting (*light harvesting takes advantage of the natural light and have sensors to turn off the artificial light and use the natural light. We have strings of light turn off based on the brightness coming through the windows. City Hall does this as well and it has been very successful*).

Building Automation Systems

- Have successfully networked 32 city facilities with building automation systems (BAS). The automation systems are web based, and everything is standardized with three vendors; this allows the City to have excellent records of performance at all locations; working on mobile devices so people in the field can instantly be aware of alarms and respond to them; have the ability to access remotely and provide a level of service to assist with problems.
- Every four months have a number of data loggers run a check through the system to benchmark how buildings are performing. With this monitoring we develop lessons learned to incorporate into our educational opportunities, specifically our NR Can training sessions. We also do one-on-one monitoring.

Water Conservation

- Have aggressively pursued water efficiency especially those connected up with Region of Peel's water rebate, so far had rebates of over \$60,000; just received substantial rebates for the irrigation systems on Brampton soccer fields.
- Through negotiations and openness by our maintenance staff, have been able to extend our pool shut down system to every 18 months from every 12 months, which will save a huge amount of water.
- Completed a cost/benefit analysis of installing solar hot water heater versus heat exchangers at our recreational swimming pools. Heat exchangers were much better in terms of return on investment. Currently installed a number of these, payback is under a year.

Information Technology

- IT Divison has engaged a 3rd party for environmentally responsible disposal of PCs and servers. This program optimizes the recovery of recyclable components such

- as plastic, steel, non ferrous and precious metals; ensures 100% diversion of e-waste from landfill; Reclaims component parts; completes end-of-life destruction; eliminates environmental liability; provides full compliance with all environmental regulations.
- Every computer in City is Energy Star Certified
 - Every computer in the City now has a power down sticker on them. This ensures that not only do we purchase computers that are best in terms of energy consumption, but encourages energy conservation behaviour. In one night of monitoring produced over a five percent reduction in our daily energy load at city hall.

City of Burlington

- The City of Burlington passed a [report](#) recommendation to approve a [green procurement policy](#) in late 2011. Amendments to the existing procurement [by-law 69-2005](#) were made through [by-law 93-2011](#) adding the following Green Procurement section.
- *The City of Burlington will endeavour to acquire goods and services that minimize impacts on the environment, and perform efficiently and effectively. While evaluating goods and services for purchase (including all aspects related to the production, transportation, use or operation, and replacement or disposal of goods), the following environmental factors will be considered in addition to the specific requirements of the good or service.*
 - *Durable, and reusable , as opposed to single use or disposable items*
 - *Non-toxic or least toxic option, preferably compostable or biodegradable*
 - *Reduce greenhouse gas and air pollutant emissions*
 - *ENERGY STAR® rated if available or most energy efficient option*
 - *Recyclable, but if not recyclable, may be disposed of safely, or, vendor will take back product at its end of life*
 - *Made from recycled materials*
 - *If made from raw materials, they have been obtained and manufactured in an environmentally sound, sustainable manner*
 - *Results in minimal or no environmental damage during normal use or maintenance*
 - *Minimum packaging (consistent with the care of the product), preferably made of reusable recycled or recyclable materials*
 - *The lifecycle cost of the product through the acquisition, operation, and end of product life, including environmental impacts (a cradle to grave approach)*
 - *Reusable shipping packaging*
- All departments and staff will be required to comply with the Green Procurement Policy when making all purchasing decisions. To assist in the implementation of

- the Green Procurement Policy the City of Burlington has developed [Guidelines](#) that covers life cycle costing and how to protect against green-washing and a [checklist](#) reviewing the environmental, packaging and disposal attributes of the goods. Throughout early 2012 the Manager of Purchasing, the Senior Sustainability Coordinator and the Sustainability Project Coordinator will organize a series of meetings to ensure that staff are aware of their roles and responsibilities.
- The Green Procurement Policy requires the Finance (Purchasing) department to report annually to the Budget and Corporate Services Committee on the progress made on the implementation of the City's Green Procurement Policy. The annual report will cover:
 - Corporate green procurement initiatives;
 - Costs and benefits of green initiatives pursued throughout the year; and,
 - Quantifiable data where available.
 - Prior to the adoption of the above Green Procurement Policy the City of Burlington was active in green procurement measures in the below areas.
 - The Towards Zero Waste Strategy which encourages staff to reduce, reuse, recycle in everyday operations.
 - The purchase of hybrid and fuel efficient vehicles that are right sized for their function.
 - Bulk purchases are made in many instances to reduce packaging.
 - Lighting retrofits at city facilities to improve energy efficiency.
 - Reuse of concrete and asphalt for road work.
 - Recycled oil is being used in vehicles.
 - The upgrade to the former print shop to the digital copy shop that minimizes the use of chemicals.
 - Green cleaning products are used.
 - The green fleet transition strategy requires staff to complete a checklist prior to acquiring vehicles to ensure they are right-sized for the job and are fuel efficient, with reduced emissions.
 - Related policies include:
 - [Corporate Energy Policy](#)
 - [Corporate Sustainable Building Policy](#)
 - [Greening the Corporate Fleet Transition Strategy](#)
 - [Toward Zero Waste Strategy](#)
 - [Implementation Plan to Restrict the Sale of Bottled Water \(in city facilities\)](#)

Town of Caledon

- Have a Green Procurement policy in Purchasing By-Law and are working on green procurement procedures. The purchase of environmentally responsible products and services may be given preference during the evaluation stage of a submission where the tender/proposal document either directly calls for “green” products or where “green” products may be priced as an option. Environmentally preferable products and services have characteristics that include but are not limited to the following: use recycled materials; are durable, reusable or are designed to be recycled; contain post-consumer recycled material; reduce waste and make efficient use of resources, including energy; have a long service life and/or can be economically and effectively repaired or upgraded; produce fewer polluting by-products and/or safety hazards during manufacturing, and/or are certified by an independent accredited organization; and/or services that use environmentally responsible practices.
- Through communications with the Environmental Progress Officer the Manager of Purchasing and Risk Management will keep apprised of environmentally sound products and services in order for the Manager of Purchasing and Risk Management to consider best purchasing practices for responsible environmental Procurement.
- Have ENERGY STAR referenced in purchasing policy, based on life cycle costing, but ENERGY STAR is referenced in the RFPs. For larger purchases require proponent to show savings.
- IT dept currently uses some “remanufactured printer cartridges”
- Caledon is reviewing the need to revise purchasing policy. Council has identified energy management, efficiency and renewables as priority actions. Looking at a green development standard for LEED silver for buildings, looking to purchase renewable energy certificates.

Town of East Gwillimbury

- A member of the York Purchasing Cooperative, which strive to manage common procurement activities of the member agencies to effectively lower costs through economies of scale and improving efficiencies, as well encourage a positive environmental impact through the procurement of sustainable goods and services.
- Have implemented a program called Employee Generated Savings; where employees submit ideas on how to save the municipality money and how to improve environmental actions.
- To reduce paper use, Council and Town staff have taken steps to provide all Committee and Council meeting agendas electronically.

The City of Guelphⁱ

- The City of Guelph has embedded commitments to environmentally sound purchasing that clearly define program priorities (i.e. waste reduction) into their corporate *Purchasing By-law* (2009). Guelph promotes cooperative purchasing in their *Purchasing By-law* and has been successful in helping to develop a joint janitorial contract that provides green cleaning supplies and garbage bags.

Town of Halton Hills

- Put geothermal in 2 fire stations, that are also going LEED. New libraries are going LEED too. This factors in life cycle costing and requires ENERGY STAR where applicable.

Halton Region

- Green purchasing policy and local food policy have been accepted by senior management. Should be going to council by late 2011 or early 2012. Targeting lighting products, paper, pest management and take out containers from cafeteria.
- Has a scent free policy.
- The purpose of Halton Region's Green Procurement Policy is to acquire goods and services ("products") from suppliers that generate positive environmental outcomes, and to integrate sustainability considerations into product selection so that negative impacts on society and the environment are minimized throughout the full life cycle of the products. Suppliers/Service Providers are expected to carry out their work in an environmentally responsible manner that includes, but is not limited to: Efficient use of natural resources; waste minimization; toxicity minimization; use of high quality materials that can be repaired or upgraded; use of renewable, recycled and recyclable materials; use of reusable parts; protection of indoor and outdoor air quality.
- Have a Green Procurement Project team that meets quarterly to review products and services.

The City of Hamilton

- The City of Hamilton has incorporated life cycle costing into purchasing decisions via their Corporate Energy Policy.
- A driving goal of this initiative has been reducing energy costs and the City of Hamilton's goal to reduce energy use by 20% from 2005 levels by 2020.
- One initiative is scrubbing the methane from wastewater and selling the bio-methane to Union Gas.

- A key part of the work is the relationships between the City and their utilities. These include Horizon Utilities and Hamilton Community Energy, both of which are operated through the City. These groups all share the same goals, and talk back and forth extensively to achieve them.
- Any proponent who brings forward an energy project in the city has to show that they are in line with the city's corporate energy policy.
- The key is that you can't always choose lowest cost capital projects, you really should be figuring out what your operating costs are likely to be in order to gage an accurate understanding of overall costs.
- The important piece of this policy is to ensure that people think about alternative projects, not always the "off-the-shelf" designs that are the easiest for consultants to put together.
- The lessons learned are that personal relationships are important. People are often in a rush and see any more policies or options as roadblocks to them getting their project finished on time. Consultants also often balk at being asked to do a life cycle analysis; they consider them more time consuming than just using an off-the-shelf design.
- It is very common for contractors to bid low and issue change orders, so you have to monitor and track the project frequently and assure that it stays true to the vision and the specifications that were originally agreed upon.
- A key question is "What is the threshold to determine when a life cycle analysis should be done"? It's a hard question to answer, and really varies by municipality.
- Some of the life cycle analysis tools can be overwhelming to staff that don't have experience with energy management etc. For that reason we worked with Efficiency Engineering Inc. to develop an easier to use Life Cycle Analysis Tool.
- Since then we have been requiring our consultants to use that tool (or a similar type tool) to provide us with Life Cycle Costing of our options.
- From 2006 until the end of 2011 cumulative energy savings for the City of Hamilton has exceeded \$23 million (\$10.8 million electricity and natural gas rates; \$3.1 million cash back; and \$9.1 million in energy conservation).
- For more information on Hamilton's energy efficiency and life cycle costing actions see [March 2012 GP COP Webinar proceedings](#).

The City of Londonⁱⁱ

- Integrated sustainable purchasing commitments into corporate *Procurement of Goods and Services Policy (2009)*. The Policy provides goals and objectives related to sustainable purchasing and outline priorities for a related program and procedures as well as supplier expectations.

City of Mississauga

The City of Mississauga is in the process of implementing their Living Green Master Plan (LGMP). The LGMP is Mississauga's first environmental master plan. It is primarily a document to prioritize City policies and programs into actions to meet the environmental objectives of the Strategic Plan. It identifies 49 actions for the City and its partners to implement over the next 10 years. The following excerpt from the LGMP describes the actions which are specific to Green Procurement:

Organization and Policy - Green Procurement

Action 19: Include training on green procurement options as part of staff training on existing procurement policies and procedures.

Action 20: Determine corporate priorities regarding the procurement of green goods and services and develop the culture, policies and practices to support these priorities.

- The City's Purchasing By-law (374-2006) includes the following principle: "Efforts shall be made to acquire goods and services that will conserve energy and help to preserve and protect the ecosphere." This principle and other supporting procurement documents have enabled many green purchases, including:
 - Green power;
 - LED traffic signals;
 - Green roofs;
 - Energy-efficient lighting retrofits and building automation systems installations;
 - Solar photovoltaic panels at the Hershey Centre;
 - Use of recycled products certified under the Environmental Choice Program for all janitorial paper products, paper towels and toilet paper at all City facilities;
 - Hybrid vehicles for parking enforcement, leadership team and inspectors; and,
 - Hybrid transit buses.

- Some of the challenges associated with green procurement include a need for greater direction as to what extent factors such as the sustainability of a product or service compares to other considerations (such as price). For generic products in particular, specifications need to provide flexibility so that green products can be considered. In addition, in some cases the green option is more expensive, and there may be no pure economic benefit or business case for spending the additional money. Coupled with this, budgets are frequently determined well in advance of the procurement process, at which time the total lifecycle cost of the product may not have been considered. As a result, the window of opportunity to

consider greener but higher cost options identified at the time of purchase may not be viable. It is important that procurement policies and practices continue to support and advance the City's green initiatives. The City should enable green procurement where green options are available. To this end, the culture and practices of the City need to:

- Require green services and products;
 - Include a willingness to pay for green services and on-shore products that may cost more;
 - Include an evaluation process that considers vendor business practices and their commitment to sustainability, environmental and ethical practices, and to the entire supply chain;
 - Invest time and effort into thorough research, budgeting and planning for lifecycle procurement; and
 - Consider the impact of the services the City consumes.
- The complete final draft of the LGMP may be viewed at the following link:
http://www5.mississauga.ca/marketing/websites/livinggreen/downloads/LGMP2011_FinalDraft.pdf

Town of Markham

- Sustainable purchasing policy being developed along with a sustainable procurement guide, developing training program for departments and staff. Likely to develop a community based social marketing initiative following the adoption of the sustainable purchasing policy.
- The Directors Forum are aware of the project, meetings with the 21 Business Units have been arranged to discuss the GPG.
- The Purchasing Department has drafted language and clauses for RFP's, to help support the procurement of environmental products and will be included in the guide.
- Within the 21 Business Units in the Town of Markham, there are various procurement practices of which the purchasing guide will highlight the most promising and innovative. Ex. Food/Catering/Local Food Plus, Janitorial Supplies (EcoLogo).
- [The Sustainable Paper Purchase and Use Guidelines](#) were adopted in 2010, by the Community and Fire Services Commission which includes, Fire, Parks, Waterworks, Operations, Asset Management, Environmental Services Departments, as well as the Art Gallery, Theatre, Museum, Libraries and Community Centres. 2010 was used as the benchmark year and 2011 was the first year of implementation. A 10% reduction target in paper use was adopted for 2011.

There are 3 main components to the Guidelines:

i) Conserving and reducing paper use

Markham uses 8.0 million sheets of paper annually for photocopying and printing. Community and Fire Services used 2.4 million sheets of paper in 2010. To reduce consumption, the Guidelines call for changing staff behaviour (through reduction targets, education, tips, best practices, reminders etc.) and through operational changes (such as eliminating hard copies of administrative forms, like absentee forms and invoices).

ii) Producing and promoting printed materials from sustainable sources

All publications are required to have 100% post consumer waste paper content (minimum 85%) and have their environmental attributes labelled.

Outside printing is to be done by a Forest Stewardship Council (FSC) certified printer and is to bear the appropriate FSC label showing the % of recycled fibre.

Internal printing from the print room (which is not FSC certified) is also to be labeled to show post consumer waste content according to the guidelines standards. All other attributes and certifications of the paper content are to be shown on all printed documents – i.e. processed chlorine free, renewable energy used.

iii) Purchasing environmentally friendly office supplies

When ordering office supplies, the Guidelines require staff to:

- choose products with the highest percentage of post consumer waste fibre content;
 - avoid plastic products (plastic report covers, folders, bindings); and,
 - choose products with the Eco Logo certification, where possible, since that certification is recognized by the Federal Government.
-
- Communications and outreach about the Guidelines was conducted in all departments and at lunch and learns. The wide range of business operations and staffing resources (part-time, summer, contract) in the Commission makes a sustainable paper program challenging to delivery.
 - A benchmark for Commission paper use was calculated for 2010 using paper purchase orders. For 2011, a trained representative from every department and facility input their orders on a spreadsheet which was posted Commission wide. This data was then cross checked against purchase orders for 2011. Examples of all printed publications are also submitted for an audit to determine compliance to Guidelines. A mid-year progress report card was published and a final report card for 2011 will be published along with recommendations shortly.

Town of Newmarket

- **Green Fund in place:** established in April 2007 with full support from the Council. Rational was to encourage green purchasing; Initially, \$25,000 was allocated to the Fund; fund is used to cover the extra cost green purchasing vs. the

- conventional ones; fund focuses on GHG emission reductions and not solely on energy use reduction; rebates and operational savings of the green products are reallocated to fund.
- **Barriers:** need a dedicated fund for green purchasing (dedicated funds can be challenging to set up); need to develop a culture of collaboration (this takes time and significant staff resources).
 - **Lessons learned:** establish a responsible department in order to implement the Fund; Establish eligibility criteria for fundable projects up front.
 - Purchasing Department has an RFP process which employs green procurement through RFPs. Purchasing department undertakes all corporate purchases and have been piloting various green purchases over the last few years.
 - Have a statement in our purchasing by-law. Purchasing staff are working on a green procurement policy and guideline. Environmentally Friendly Products and Services: The purchase of environmentally-responsible products and services will be considered at all times. These products and services are defined as those having a lesser or reduced effect on human health and the environment when compared to other products and services that serve the same purpose. Specifications will include, unless otherwise justified, environmentally-responsible products that: use recycled materials; are durable, reusable or are designed to be recycled; consume fewer resources in their manufacture and/or their use; and services that use environmentally-responsible practices.
 - Have an energy coordinator and corporate energy policy, so more of our purchasing for lighting and HVAC equipment is energy efficient. Have a green fleet transition strategy to help green fleet (using hybrids and rightsizing, etc.). And council recently adopted a Corporate Green Building Policy where LEED silver is targeted for city facilities greater than 500 square metres or major facility retrofits. Council has also approved a Zero Waste Strategy and a plan to restrict the sale of bottled water in city facilities.

Town of Oakville

- **Oakville's definition of sustainable procurement:** "The purchasing of environmentally preferable products, goods and services that have a lesser or reduced effect on human health and the environment when compared with other goods and services that serve a similar purpose." Policy does state that the sustainable criteria should not undermine the efficacy of the product or service.
- The **sustainable purchasing procedure (SPP)** was adopted in 2009. Town has a sustainable policy and the sustainable procurement procedure hangs under that policy, as does the green fleet procedure and a few other procedures.
- Of the 7 sustainable purchasing goals, the idea is to achieve a minimum of 3 of the 7 goals with every purchase, and fulfilling more is preferred. (1. make efficient use of natural resources; 2. minimize waste; 3. give preference for high quality materials that can be repaired or upgraded; 4. minimize toxicity; 5. use renewable

- or recycled materials; 6. contain reusable parts or has reusability; 7. protect indoor and outdoor air quality).
- Initial focus on making departments and vendors aware of sustainable procurement procedure. The procedure applies to all purchases and to all departments.
 - Developed internal website to support implementation of the procurement policy. Developed tip card and guide. Future Guides will be in online format to ensure updated information.
 - Made sustainable procurement presentations to all departments. Presentations made to council and to all executive and senior management.
 - Have trained staff on signs of green washing to look out for and how to look for third party certified products. Priority on third party certified products: ENERGY STAR; EcoLogo; FSC; and the difference between recycled content and post-consumer recycled content.
 - Worked with Staples to provide a specific green guide so that green products are not hidden away in the big catalogue. Also worked with them to ensure that when Town of Oakville staff are browsing the Staples website the greener product is highlighted in their searches. Oakville also returns all boxes and catalogues to them.
 - Vendors are encouraged to go to the Town's purchasing website bidding to register their green or sustainable products and services. Once all their documentation is received, they receive an Electronic-Certification from the Town.
 - The E approved logo allows vendors to prove that they are environmentally friendly before even bidding on a contract. They can apply for this certification through the Town.
 - Local Retail Purchases. Have gone through highly used stores websites, checked their certified greener products and have highlighted those products to streamline the green options.
 - Green fleets and green buildings are being dealt with through other procedures.
 - Have placed a strong focus on contracted services. Rewriting contracted services to extend producer responsibility.
 - Oakville has decentralized purchasing, which means that there are a lot of staff members that make purchases to fulfill the needs of their department. This makes it difficult to track purchases, as there are so many purchasers throughout the town.
 - Anything that goes to an RFP has to come through the sustainable purchasing procedures, but it makes it a lot more difficult to track individual purchases.
 - Vendor awareness was key; and the Town did their best to inform vendors that their priorities and requirements were changing.
 - The Towards Zero Waste (TZW) Program has worked well in conjunction with the Sustainable Purchasing Procedure (SPP). Thanks to the TZW program, the

- disposal options of a purchase are considered before a purchase is made, which has helped with the SPP.
- During the past waste reduction week, the Town of Oakville won two Recycling Council of Ontario awards, thanks in large part to the TZW and SPP.
 - The Tip Card that was given out to staff was aimed at creating brand awareness and to ensure that purchasers know the trusted certifications as opposed to some of the Green-washing that can go on.
 - There was a hard cover manual given out to a few select purchasers, but now the preference is to route departments through the website, which includes links to [Whistler, BC's sustainable purchasing guidelines](#).
 - The environmental department has been paying for some of the pilot projects to absorb the costs of greener projects, which has helped with adoption in more budget-sensitive departments.
 - In 2006, there was a small clause in the purchasing bylaw, but then in 2010 there was a bylaw change that went much further. Schedule J was added, which ensures that environmental considerations are taken into account in every purchasing decision.
 - The 2010 bylaw changed the purchasing framework, making it so that environmental considerations are taken into account right from the first step of the purchasing decision. While not everyone in the town goes through the entire purchasing bylaw, for those that do work on purchasing, the framework has proven to be quite helpful.
 - Packaging has been considered under schedule K which requires vendors to take responsibility for the packaging waste and to recycle or dispose of it responsibly. For example, some of the materials have been delivering products to the Town in refillable totes that are taken away by the supplier and refilled. The specifications under schedule K also allow for some of the purchasing decisions to be sent back to the environmental department to ensure that the SPP is being followed.
 - Third party certified products were the first priority for example green cleaning products and EcoLogo certification is now the norm. A challenge for using EcoLogo cleaning supplies has been in the arenas, where they haven't been able to find a product that takes the black marks off of the boards.
 - The cafeteria made many changes, including stopping selling bottled water, bringing in compostable cups and take-out packaging, removing Styrofoam, switching to fair trade coffee and tea, which incurred a higher cost on their part.
 - Sustainable purchasing for services is something the Town has been working on by adding environmental considerations into service RFPs. For example Shredding of confidential materials is done on site, so often the shredding truck is idling for a long time, so that was a consideration in the RFP.
 - In the past, building demolition or furniture removal was done where the furniture was kept in a storage facility until there could be an auction. Junk Co collects furniture, refurbishes what they can and sells them at their re-use store.

- Measurables are very important. You need to track what you're doing and illustrate your successes although this has been difficult.
- Lessons learned: top down support is important – the change won't likely happen without council and senior management support.
- Need various forms of communications: internet, face-to-face presentations and training, hard copies of outreach resources.
- Need to make sure you get the information to people, cannot expect them to hunt it down; need to make it easy for them to change their old habits.
- Monitor progress: Sustainable procurement has been easier to monitor than zero waste. We have been putting monitoring process as the responsibility of suppliers and vendors. For example, Staples tracks the percentage of products that are green. They have a very good tracking system. Have also inserted language into lighting contracts to track use and return of CFLs.
- Need to give credit to those taking the lead. Intranet site highlights who is doing what within the various goals and programs.
- For more information on Oakville's sustainable purchasing actions and resources see the CAC Green Procurement November 2011 and December 2009 webinars. (http://www.cleanairpartnership.org/intranet_gp-cop_meetings)

City of Oshawa

- Presently working on Oshawa Strategic Plan (OSP) that has an overriding principle of sustainability. The development and implementation of a green purchasing policy has been identified as an action in the OSP.
- The Oshawa City Hall Revitalization Project, including a new Council Chamber and retrofit of existing Rundle Tower, was built to LEED certified standard. The City is gaining knowledge and expertise of green considerations of purchases via that process. For example, have selected Interface carpets for New City Hall. Past priority actions included recycled paper. Other priority areas include green cleaning products.
- The commitment to build LEED standards has provided an opportunity to try to implement green strategies. This has included the purchase of Interface carpeting, low VOC furniture and paints, ENERGY STAR appliances and IT equipment.
- Received credit by adopting a Green Cleaning Strategy which involved amending service contract with cleaners and limiting the purchase of chemicals and cleaners from suppliers to those products that met Green Seal or equivalent standard.
- A second innovation LEED point was the City's Scent Free policy: biggest obstacle was Human Resources department who felt this was a human rights issue. However, since Council had approved us pursuing this LEED point it went ahead; had to get buy-in from the Unions, a policy approved by HR and establish guidelines. Process - HR put out a newsletter that explained the City was becoming a scent free workplace, what the transition period was, what it meant,

- why we were doing it (policy and flyer available at the March 2011 GP COP webinar proceedings: <http://www.cleanairpartnership.org/node/547>)
- Important to factor concentration and amounts needed when undertaking financial costs; Green Seal or Eco logo green products on the Swish program are very cost effective as they are often highly concentrated; certified products protects from potential green washing.
 - Have ENERGY STAR computers, having a challenge getting computers shut down as IT needs them on for software upgrades. Looking at software that would allow remote start up to overcome this obstacle. Identifying the business case of the costs of software versus the energy savings.

Region of Peel

- Developed a Lifecycle Cost Calculator Tool: consists of the total acquisition cost including: purchase price, permit and licensing cost, appropriate taxes, rebate - cost recovery, provides negative number for the lifecycle cost calculation; annual operating and maintenance cost (including training); environmental cost (regulatory compliance); disposal cost; salvage-cost recovery: provides negative number for the lifecycle cost calculation; and environmentally safe disposal cost.
- For social housing only buy ENERGY STAR appliances. While no ENERGY STAR policy is in place, lifecycle costing has been around for a few years in the Region and this automatically favors energy efficiency appliances but factors it in via life cycle costing so it does depend on the purchase price and operating costs.
- For example, used LCC for replacement of windows, looked at savings and set a standard for the region. Also looked at the environmental impacts when it gets to the end of its lifecycle. When new buildings are constructed, have to do lifecycle costing on major appliances.
- Looking at E-Procurement, putting together a business case for changing the procurement process.
- In the process of a research library for the extensive green procurement research materials and the lifecycle cost calculator and willing to share both research materials as well as the calculator with other municipalities.
- Performance based specification is best to be included within the RFPs, especially where third party certification is already in place (ex. ENERGY STAR).
- In Peel, in some cases the equipment performance will be checked with sub-metering. If performance is not per the manufacturer's specification, the vendor shall rectify this situation at the vendor's expense. This rectification requirement shall survive the warranty period.
- Doing sustainability training with various departments and stakeholders. Engaging client groups and providing them with training on how to factor in sustainability into purchasing decisions. Working with Natural Step to do Sustainable procurement training and plan. Have a draft procurement policy working that through the approval process; but already working with a number

of client groups to green purchases. Next focus is on green cafeteria products have a university student doing research on bio-based cafeteria products.

City of Pickering

- [Purchasing Policy](#) updated in late 2011 and includes sustainability considerations and promoting the use of GIPPER's Guide to support the waste policy.
- Sustainable Considerations include: *Consider and where appropriate include one or more of the following matters when preparing specifications for the acquisition of goods and services:*
 - *reducing greenhouse gas emissions*
 - *protecting indoor and outdoor air quality*
 - *improving energy fuel and water efficiencies*
 - *improving biodiversity*
 - *protecting the quality and quantity of ground and surface water systems*
 - *minimizing packaging and waste*
 - *making efficient use of natural resources and using sustainable harvesting or extraction practices including Forest Stewardship Council FSC certified papers*
 - *giving preference to high quality durable materials that can be repaired and/or upgraded*
 - *requiring materials that contain reusable parts and/or that are made from renewable compostable or recyclable materials or can be taken back for recycling*
 - *reducing or eliminating hazardous or toxic substance*
 - *minimizing human health impacts*
- Pickering's past green procurement measures focused on sustainable meetings, having caterers provide non disposable dish and glassware to cut waste, as well as biodegradable cutlery.
- City of Pickering has been using FSC 100% recycled copy paper since 2007 and continues to integrate additional product lines which have recycled content ENERGY STAR, EcoLogo, FSC are considerations in purchasing decisions).

Town of Richmond Hill

- Completed Richmond Hill's People Plan, which serves as the community sustainable action plan. http://www.town.richmond-hill.on.ca/subpage.asp?pageid=people_plan_richmond_hill
- Green procurement is identified as an action to be undertaken in that plan.

The City of Toronto

- City of Toronto's Green Purchasing Policy information can be accessed at: http://www.toronto.ca/calldocuments/pdf/environment_procurement.pdf

- The goal of the environmentally responsible procurement policy is to increase the development, awareness and purchase of environmentally preferred products and services. This goal is pursued via continuously increasing the development, awareness and purchase of environmentally preferred products as new regulations, new products and new initiatives enter the marketplace through two sub initiatives:

Development and Awareness:

- Founding member and continuing member of steering committee of the Governments Incorporating Procurement Policies that are Environmentally Responsible (GIPPER) who's mandate is to educate and influence the procurement community by encouraging best practices in sustainable procurement and by promoting the use of environmentally responsible products and services. Toronto played a lead role in developing the *GIPPER's Guide to Environmental Purchasing*. The most recent third edition is a tool to assist purchasers in incorporating environmental considerations into procurement processes. It lists guidelines for frequently used products with a focus on reducing waste. GIPPER includes representation from federal, regional and municipal governments, and broader public service organizations including universities, school boards and standards organizations.

Purchasing:

- The environmentally preferred procurement policy is incorporated in Request for Proposals. Proponents are requested to submit with their bid how the products and/or services offered are environmentally preferred. Proposals are then evaluated on a points system including points awarded for environmental preferred proposals based on award point scoring criteria.
- The environmentally preferred procurement policy is incorporated in Request for Quotes. Bidders are to state if their offered products meet Environment Canada's Environmental Choice Program certifications or other G-7 recognized environmental equivalent certifications. Where no Environmental Choice Program certifications exist or the marketplace has limited competition, "ER3" environmental load reducing components are specified.
- The [City of Toronto RFP and RFQ Environmental Criteria listing](#) provides sample text for environmental criteria for various purchases and services that can be added to RFPs and RFQs.

City of Vaughan

- *Green Directions Vaughan*, the Community Sustainability and Environmental Master Plan identifies green purchasing as a priority action. (<http://www.vaughantomorrow.ca/EMP/empreport.html>)
- A Green Procurement policy has been drafted and integrated into the Purchasing Services Manual and is expected to be presented to Council in early 2012. Heavy emphasis on building capacity of staff through training and dissemination of information as well as promoting green procurement to suppliers.
- Have successfully integrated green third party certified products/service specifications into new City owned building, New City Hall janitorial services and supplies contract, copier paper, envelopes, stationery , LED street lights.

York Region

- Regional policy requires that new corporate facilities be built to a minimum standard of LEED® Silver. This encourages the use of materials that are recycled, regional, rapidly renewable, sustainably harvested and low-emitting.
- York Region's Sustainability Strategy and Corporate Air Quality Strategy require green procurement. A Sustainable Product Policy and Work Plan are being developed under the umbrella of LEED® for Existing Buildings at the Regional Administrative Centre. This will include ongoing consumables, durable goods such as furniture and electrical equipment, reduced-mercury lamps, materials used for facility alterations, and green housekeeping products and services.
- York Region has invested in software to support computer based collaboration and virtual meetings to reduce the need for travel among Regional staff
- York Region purchases commercial grade PCs and printers and this has allowed the Region to extend the useful life of these devices to a minimum of 4 years for PCs and 5 years for multi-function printers
- York Region has migrated the majority of the Regions servers in the data centers to Blade Technology, which saves floor space, electricity and cooling requirements.
- York Region has implemented Server Virtualization technologies in the data centers enabling much more efficient server utilization and a reduction in the need for more server equipment.
- York Region moved to a Voice over IP network technology which has eliminated the need for separate data network and separate voice network equipment.

Town of Whitby

- A Green Procurement Policy has been identified as a key objective, and a dedicated Purchasing Analyst will draft, implement and track the Policy. The policy will ensure that the goods and services necessary for the provision of

- municipal services are obtained in an effective and environmentally friendly manner at the best overall value.
- The Greening the Fleet initiative started with purchasing the first hybrid vehicle in 2007. The fleet now has four hybrid vehicle used by By-Law, Parking Enforcement and Operations Staff.
 - Hired a consultant to examine the potential opportunity to participate in the FIT program. The Town is assessing the feasibility of installing solar PV units on municipal facilities.
 - Procuring green cleaning products for use in Town facilities through Swish.
 - A Whitby Sustainability Advisory Committee will be set up once the Sustainability Coordinator position has been filled.
 - Municipal Information Systems (MIS) are introducing the installation of auto-awake systems that can be turned on by MIS at off-peak hours for upgrades and updates to staff computers. This allows desktops to be shut down during off hours to save energy.
 - The majority of the Town's data centre is VMware based. Whitby currently runs the equivalent of 40 servers off three. Energy consumption has been dramatically reduced by moving to a Virtualized Server environment.
 - Have procured new desktops that are Energy Star 5.0 and have power supplies that are up to 90% energy efficient. LED Monitors are also Energy Star 5.0 and EPEAT Gold rating, arsenic-free glass, mercury-free panel, BFR/CFR-PVC-free parts (excluding cables) and a chassis that features more than 25% post-consumer recycled materials.
 - Public Works is utilizing reclaimed asphalt wherever possible in road construction projects.
 - Public Works is also replacing traffic signal bulbs and pedestrian signals with LED bulbs.
 - Town facility lighting has been upgraded to high-efficiency lighting helping to reduce energy usage and cost.
 - Registered with the Recycling Council of Ontario's Take Back the Light Program an environmental initiative working towards proper disposal of lamps, ballasts and fixtures.
 - Have purchased and installed timers for parking garage lights, as well as Intelligent Parking Lot Controllers for exterior engine block heater circuits
 - Participating in the Durham Strategic Energy Alliance's Electronic Vehicle To Grid project. The project has two goals: The first is assessing the impact of electric vehicles on the smart grid throughout Durham, and second, evaluating potential business models for owning electric vehicle charging infrastructure. Durham College Whitby is now home to one of seven electric vehicle charging stations in Durham Region. Charging stations will also be set up Iroquois Park Sports Centre and Whitby Hydro.
 - The Town has committed to include requirements build to LEED equivalent standards in any future major municipal construction contracts.

- Launched the “Sort it Right” public space waste minimization program. The program features new standardized four-stream sort waste containers for recycling, green bin waste and garbage. The “Sort it Right” program offers additional opportunities to minimize the waste going to landfill by placing the new bins in public spaces in nine Town facilities including libraries, community centres, recreation and sports facilities, the marina and the Seniors’ Activity Centre.
- Have procured and upgraded Building Automation Systems in most major Municipal Facilities. These systems control HVAC and lighting systems as well as provide load shifting for large motor startups. Building Automation Systems enable significant energy savings to be realized.

City of Windsor

- The City of Windsor has an environmental consideration built into the Purchasing by-law.
- The development of an environmentally friendly purchasing policy has been identified in the Environmental Master Plan as being important in order to increase resource efficiency, conserve water and energy and reduce waste.
- Therefore, the Environment and Sustainability department is currently collaborating with the Purchasing department to develop a *Sustainable Purchasing Policy* to further guide the department when acquiring goods from the community.
- Windsor is currently making sustainable procurement decisions by purchasing hybrid buses, high post consumer recycled paper, LED lights and non-toxic janitorial products.

Non CAC Canadian Municipal Green/Sustainable Policies/Procedures/Actions

Resort Municipality of Whistler (RMOW)

- Sustainable purchasing Framework came out of the Whistler 2020 Community Sustainability Plan.
- RMOW worked with The Natural Step on their Sustainability Plan and the Sustainable purchasing.
- Sustainable procurement policy was adopted in December 2006. It applies to all municipal departments and each are trained on how to implement the policy and they are held accountable for their purchasing decisions.
- If a green product or service is not available they are then required to send a message to the supplier to let the supplier know what they are looking for.
- **Lessons learned:** the decentralized approach has the benefit that experts and knowledge of various green products and services can be spread across departments. Specialized knowledge is not kept in any single department or

- person but spread across the jurisdiction. Just need to make sure there are mechanisms and strategies in place to ensure that knowledge and expertise is shared. The decentralized approach however benefits greatly from an overall policy direction from council in the form of a green procurement policy. Green purchasing doesn't necessarily cost more – need to get that message out there. Taking a life cycle cost into consideration can often deal with different purchase price considerations. Also need to factor in the cost of not sticking to your commitments and message.
- **Challenges:** Collaboration and sharing of stories was required to gain the change in behaviour, information alone will not be able to change behaviour. Sharing success stories and finding local champions in various departments was crucial.
 - There is a big focus on measuring and monitoring the progress the policy is having.
 - RMOW's Steps to go through in increasing sustainable purchasing. 1. Identify the products service. 2. Assess the need for the product. 3. Identify the products contents. 4. Identify current sustainability impacts, both positive and negative. 5. If product is not available, envision what a more sustainable product would look like and share goal with suppliers. 6. Identify and prioritize more sustainable options. What this stepped process has done is open up conversations and thought processes that did not exist before. There are worksheets that help people with these steps and questions.
 - RMOW has a whole series of resources that are available at RMO whistler website (<http://www.whistler2020.ca/whistler/site/genericPage.acds?context=1967998&instanceid=1967999>)

City of Thunderbay

- Thunderbay adopted a Sustainable Environmental & Ethical Procurement (SEEP) into their new Supply Management By-Law. They are presently developing a measurable implementation plan to enhance their commitment to SEEP.
- Have developed Supplier Code of Conduct which outlines City's environmental and social expectations of supply partners.
- Also encourage supply chain practices that have a positive impact on sustainable, ethical and environmental procurement (SEEP).
- The City's CIT department have a procedure which supports remanufactured cartridges and also supports environmentally responsible computer equipment with ENERGY STAR rating.

City of Edmonton ⁱⁱⁱ

- Edmonton's Sustainable Purchasing Policy developed an action plan early on in the program design phase. The plan outlined milestones, key actions, responsibility, timelines, and current status.

- Online software was used to “house” the Action Plan. This enabled the project team to login at anytime to view current status of action items and provide updates on work completed.
- Edmonton has dedicated one full-time employee (i.e. Senior Buyer) to oversee the implementation of their Sustainable Purchasing Policy and program.
- In 2009, the City formed a cross-functional sustainable purchasing implementation team that included representatives from Materials Management, Office of the Environment, Office of Diversity and Inclusion and Corporate Communications.
- Edmonton recently organized a sustainable purchasing tradeshow for key staff to learn about sustainable products and services and the new Sustainable Purchasing Policy and program.
- This was an important communication event that engaged administrative staff who make low value purchases and are decentralized across the organization.
- Edmonton’s sustainable trade fair was also a great opportunity to engage a wide variety of their vendors, who were invited to showcase their sustainability options to administrative buyers.
- Edmonton has also been engaging with key suppliers, such as their office supplies vendor, to identify options for increasing the purchase of green alternatives and also developing a packaging take-back program.

City of Vancouver ^{iv}

- Developed an action plan to guide the development of the second phase of the Sustainable and Ethical Purchasing Program. It outlined project elements, milestones, action items, timelines, and provided space for noting status of action items and milestones.
- It is updated regularly by the project team and is delivered to management, periodically, as a status report for program development.
- In 2009, a new Corporate Purchasing Policy was developed by purchasing staff and approved by Council. This new policy integrated the requirements of the EPP as well as additional environmental and economic sustainability requirements for purchasing practices.
- This embedded triple-bottom-line commitments into corporate purchasing policy, ensuring that sustainability was no longer a stand-alone issue.
- The City of Vancouver recently created Category Manager Positions that are accountable for implementing new Corporate Purchasing Policy, which includes triple-bottom-line sustainability commitments.
- In 2009, Vancouver retained external subject matter expertise to help design program implementation tools, procedures and other resources.

City of Calgary^v

- In response to a City Council directive, Calgary City staff developed a comprehensive triple-bottom-line purchasing policy, the *Sustainable, Environmental and Ethical Purchasing Policy (SEPP)*, in 2007.
- The SEPP is a comprehensive, 8-page policy that clearly defines purpose, scope, procedures, accountability and linkages to other City policy and the Supplier Code of Conduct.
- In 2006, City Council directed the development of the SEPP to broaden their purchasing commitments beyond the existing Green Procurement Policy and to align their practices with other city policies, such as the Triple Bottom Line Policy, the Environmental Policy and other related initiatives.

Town of Olds^{vi}

- Olds demonstrates a strong commitment to social, environmental and economic sustainability in their purchasing practices by meeting Transfair Canada's "Fair Trade Town" standards (see <http://transfair.ca/en/get-involved/fair-trade-towns>)
- This means being dedicated through policy and practice to serving only Fair Trade certified coffee, tea and sugar in their facilities and promoting consumption in their community. Fair Trade Certified products meet third-party standards for *social, economic and environmental sustainability*. This ensures that products are produced under fair conditions (e.g. safe, healthy conditions and fair pay) and sustainable agricultural practices.

City of Ottawa^{vii}

- The City of Ottawa developed a Supplier Code of Conduct (SCC) to define the minimum labour standards for the City's Ethical Purchasing Policy (2007).
- The Supply and Finance Department tracks performance and provides a status report update on the implementation of the City's Ethical Purchasing Policy and the vendor compliance practices to the Corporate Services and Economic Development Committee.
- The report outlines financial and legal implications of implementing this policy and provides recommendations for advancing performance related to this policy.
- During the first year of implementing their EPP, the Supply Branch engaged with the services of the Maquila Solidarity Network (MSN) to develop methods for improving implementation.
- MSN is a well respected labour right organization that leads Canadian efforts for workers rights in global supply chains to win improved wages, working conditions, and quality of life.

- All suppliers and subcontractors to the City must comply with the SCC standards and the City publicly discloses the names and locations of manufacturing facilities in order enable reporting of violations of the SCC in these facilities.

Regional Municipality of Wood Buffalo (RMWB) ^{viii}

- RMWB retained external subject matter expertise to support the development of the Sustainable Purchasing Administrative Directive. The consultant provided customized sustainable purchasing policy language that was integrated into an overarching new directive.

Halifax Regional Municipality ^{ix}

- To support their green fleet sustainable purchasing initiative, Halifax has developed a Vehicle Right-Sizing Filter and Life Cycle Evaluation Methodology that are formally applied to annual budgeting and business planning processes.
- Implementation of these tools required the development of standardized collaborative processes between Fleet Services, clients and Financial Services, enabling continued progress in sustainable procurement initiatives that meet the measures of the Corporate Local Action Plan to Reduce Greenhouse Gas Emissions.
- Halifax has tapped into provincial sustainable purchasing online training programs. This resource has been important in providing the knowledge and skills needed for purchasing staff to advance sustainable purchasing performance.

City of Whitehorse ^x

- Whitehorse recently sourced City jackets for staff that were made of recycled fibres by a Canadian supplier. Staff were made aware of the sustainability attributes to demonstrate how the City is striving to integrate sustainability considerations into their supply chain. This also provided the opportunity to gather feedback on the product as well as staff's perceptions and expectations of sustainable purchasing in general.

City of Saskatoon ^{xi}

- Saskatoon's purchasing department tracks their sustainable purchasing performance and reports the number and type of sustainable contracts issued every six month to senior executives.

Provincial Green/Sustainable Policies/Procedures/Actions

Province of Nova Scotia

- Sustainable procurement came out of legislation (Environmental Goals and Sustainable Prosperity Act (EGSPA)).
- Sustainable procurement policy approved since August 2009. Applies to all provincial government departments.
- There are 19 government departments in Nova Scotia and about 11,000 staff. Government owns or leases 2000 buildings; 2,300 vehicles in fleet; and each year spend \$750 million dollars in goods and services.
- If we were to add in the spending of the rest of the MUSH (municipalities, universities, schools and hospitals) sector, at least double that amount, providing a huge opportunity to influence the market.
- Nova Scotia's definition of Sustainable Procurement: "procurement that factors in environmental, economical and social criteria and attempts to achieve best value on all three fronts." Government departments have looked at environmental procurement in the past (esp. Environment and Energy departments) but have now added social criteria to the mix.
- **There are 9 key areas to consider:** Fiscal Responsibility; Support for Local Economy; Life Cycle Costing; Toxics Use Reduction; Waste Reduction; Greenhouse Gas Reduction; Health and Safety; Inclusiveness and Fair Wage; Health Promotion.
- Bringing vendors and suppliers up to speed on where we are at now and where we want to be.
- Priority products include: paper towels; toilet tissue; garbage bag; re-manufactured toner cartridges; printers and multifunction devices; computers.
- There are a whole bunch of purchases made that are outside the standing offer route and working with departments to help train them to factor in sustainable criteria into purchasing decisions. Developed training program to do that. Training program will be on-going.
- Also developed specific training programs for specific departments to factor in their selective purchasing.
- **Developed new purchasing cycle:** Identify need; determine best way to meet need; envision a sustainable purchase; describe your requirements; get quotes or tender; evaluate quotes or bids; manage the contract or purchase.
- Policy has shifted from lowest bid to best value so that allows sustainable criteria to be factored in. In tenders, environmental criteria are inserted into the tender agreement.
- The policy applies to provincial departments only, but part of the policy is to work with the MUSH sector. Have developed a network to work together on specifications and reduce the duplication of work and provide some consistency

to make it easier for vendors. The Province's purchasing documentation; resources and training are all available to the MUSH sector.

- Nova Scotia Sustainable procurement website:
<https://www.gov.ns.ca/tenders/sustproc/>

Unites States Municipal/State Green/Sustainable Policies/Procedures/Actions

City of Portland

Portland's *Code of Conduct for Apparel Contractors (2008)* specifies minimum standards and is based on the principle that contractors, subcontractors and suppliers comply with all applicable laws and regulations, including ILO labour conventions.

The Code also specifies that all suppliers comply with the United Nations' Universal Declaration of Human Rights and Rights of the Child conventions and that all forms of discrimination of women be eliminated from supplier workplaces.

City of Seattle

Boilerplate language pertaining to anti-idling of delivery vehicles, use of 100% post-consumer waste copy paper, mandatory duplex printing as well as desirable custom specifications have been created to support purchasing staff in addressing sustainability in solicitation documents.

Seattle staff worked closely with the Responsible Procurement Network (RPN) as well as Office Depot to develop their office products RFP. The RPN was able to provide support on product specification development while Office Depot provided expertise on developing a web portal for online ordering to simplify identifying green office supplies.

King County

In their *2009 Environmental Purchasing Annual Report* King County summarizes the data collected for their environmentally preferable product purchases and reports on communication and publicity efforts for their program.

The report documents the how much money was spent on environmental products and how much money environmental purchasing and recycling efforts saved the County (i.e. \$1.5 million). Reporting this data is important in demonstrating the value of their environmental purchasing and recycling programs and generating further support.

Green/Sustainable Purchasing Networks

The Municipal Collaboration for Sustainable Purchasing

- Nine municipalities of various size and geographic distribution formed the Municipal Collaboration for Sustainable Purchasing (hereinafter *the Collaboration*) in the summer of 2010 (see list of participants below). The main goal of the Collaboration is to advance sustainable purchasing across Canada within the municipal sector by sharing resources, knowledge and best practices. Participants want to learn effective methods for embedding corporate sustainability objectives within the purchasing function in order to realize the financial, management, environmental and socio-economic benefits of sustainable purchasing.
- **The Collaboration includes the following nine municipalities:** Whitehorse, Yukon; Edmonton, Alberta; Olds, Alberta; Regional Municipality of Wood Buffalo, Alberta; Guelph, Ontario; London, Ontario; Ottawa, Ontario; Saskatoon, Saskatchewan; Halifax, Nova Scotia

Greening Greater Toronto Green Procurement Group

With a Leadership Council of 45 public and private sector procurement executives representing \$45 billion in annual purchasing, the Green Procurement Initiative aims to facilitate green procurement practices in organizations across the GTA and help drive the success of Ontario's green sector. GGT leverages the expertise and purchasing power of this exceptional group of volunteers to develop and execute the programs and materials below.

Commitment to Buy Green

- To date, GGT has secured a [Commitment to Buy Green](#) from a number of large private and public member organizations that commits them to continuous improvement in reducing their environmental impact through the greening of procurement.

Green Exchange Events

- More than 150 buyers and vendors have attended four discussion-oriented meetings on specific sustainable procurement topics including information technology, lighting and waste as well as a Reverse Marketplace.

Green Marketplace

- The 2009 Marketplace event saw 25+ green suppliers, 100+ senior procurement executives as well as industry experts' network and explore green technologies and services. The outcome report, [Buyers and Sellers Don't See Eye to Eye](#), summarizes surprising results collected during the event's follow-up survey.

Document Hub

- Portal hosted on the GGT and [Partners in Project Green](#) websites with more than 300 green procurement-related documents and other practical resources developed by our member organizations and other contributors.

Green Supplier Cluster Analysis

- A preliminary assessment of green supplier clusters across Ontario, including green products, services, and technologies, highlighting regions where higher concentrations of business activity exist (2009).

Green Paper Report

- Developed by participating corporate buyers, this report addresses the complexities involved in buying paper and helps organizations identify how to improve the sustainability of their purchasing practices (April, 2011).

Partners in Project Green

Partners in Project Green is a community of businesses working together to green their bottom line by creating an internationally-recognized 'eco-business zone' around Toronto Pearson Airport Area. Through new forms of business-to-business collaboration, Partners in Project Green delivers programming that helps businesses reduce energy and resource costs, uncover new business opportunities, and address everyday operational challenges in a green and cost-effective manner. Partners in Project Green is creating the Pearson Eco-Business Zone, envisioned to be an **internationally recognized community known for its competitive, high performance and eco-friendly business climate.**

Greening Procurement is one area of activity for PPG. Resources developed include:

- Green Procurement Companion Guide – a guide to support the implementation of a green procurement program.
- Online Collection of Case Studies – integration of case studies that highlight green procurement in action.
- Database of Documents – collection of documents used by others to operationalize their green procurement programs.

Additional Green/Sustainable Purchasing Resources Summary

Life Cycle Costing

- ENERGY STAR has a lifecycle cost calculator to factor in operating costs that are slightly more upfront.
- Region of Peel has a Life Cycle Costing Policy in place.
- Hamilton has developed a lifecycle costing tool and requires all consultants/contractors to provide life Cycle Costing Options (see March 2012 webinar meeting below for more information).

LED Pathway and Streetlighting

The Toronto Atmospheric Fund just held a Street Lighting Summit where they presented some case studies of municipalities testing out LED street lights. [Summit Proceedings here](#).

The goal of the [Lightsavers](#) project is to take all the pilot projects being tested right now and they are being monitored on in the same way to enable them to be compared and the business case to be built on a lot more pilot projects than just their own.

Clean Air Council Green Procurement Intranet Resources

Meetings Page

2012

- [March 9th, 2012: Life Cycle Analysis and Municipal Green Procurement Policies and Actions](#)

2011

- [November 8, 2011: Sustainable Procurement Actions, Experiences and Lessons Learned - Town of Oakville and Town of Markham](#)
- [September 29, 2011: Sustainable Procurement Networks](#)
- [May 12, 2011: Responsible Purchasing Network: Compostible Service Ware](#)
- [April 12, 2011: York Region Green Power Purchasing and E-Procurement Actions, Opportunities and Plans](#)
- [March 29, 2011: Oshawa Cleaning Products and Brampton Green Procurement Activities](#)
- [March 23, 2011: Green Procurement and Energy Star Opportunities and Resources](#)
- [March 8, 2011: 2011 Green Procurement Workplan and Greening Paper Purchases](#)

2009

- [December 2009: Green Procurement Activities- Nova Scotia and Oakville](#)
- [October 2009: Greening Greater Toronto and Whistler, BC](#)
- [February 2009: Newmarket Green Fund, Peel Life Cycle Calculator](#)

Resources Page

Greening Greater Toronto Document Hub

- [Assessments and Supplier Evaluations](#)
- [Calculators and Valuation](#)
- [Case Studies](#)
- [External Resources](#)
- [Guides - General Green Procurement Guides](#)

Guides - Specific Products and Materials

- [Cleaning](#)
- [Construction, Building](#)
- [Electronics and Computers](#)
- [Food](#)
- [Green Energy, Credits and Offsets](#)
- [Lighting](#)
- [Paint](#)
- [Paper, Wood and Fibre](#)
- [Retail](#)
- [Supply Chain](#)
- [Vehicles, Machines and Transports](#)
- [Water and Bottles](#)
- -
- [Policies and Programs - Corporates](#)
- [Policies and Programs - Government](#)
- [Reporting and Accountability -Corporate](#)
- [Reports, Articles and Thought Leadership](#)

Partners in Project Green Document Hub

- [Green Procurement Sustainable Opportunities Database](#)
- [Green Procurement Case Studies](#)
- [Green Procurement Programs Database](#)

Labelling Programs

- [Energy Star in Canada](#)
- [Canada Eco Logo Program](#)
- [Forest Stewardship Council of Canada](#)
- [Natural Resources Canada Energy Programs](#)

Other Networks

- [The Natural Step Canada](#)
- [BC Sustainable Purchasing Network](#)
- [Ontario Institute of Purchasing Management Association of Canada](#)

Green Procurement Toolkit Table of Contents

- [Green Procurement Draft Monitoring and Reporting Survey](#)
- [GTA Green Procurement Policies and Resources](#)
- [Non-GTA CAC Sample Green Procurement Policies](#)
- [Product Criteria and Specifications Resources](#)
- [Green Procurement Outreach Resources](#)
- [Green Procurement Calculators](#)
- [Local Food Procurement](#)
- [Bottled Water Bans](#)
- [Sample Green Procurement Toolkits](#)
- [Additional Green Procurement Reports and Resources](#)

ⁱ Information taken from: [Municipal Collaboration for Sustainable Purchasing - Trends and Best Practices in Canadian Municipal Sustainable Purchasing](#); Prepared by Reeve Consulting, December 2010.

ⁱⁱ Information taken from: [Municipal Collaboration for Sustainable Purchasing - Trends and Best Practices in Canadian Municipal Sustainable Purchasing](#); Prepared by Reeve Consulting, December 2010.

ⁱⁱⁱ Information taken from: [Municipal Collaboration for Sustainable Purchasing - Trends and Best Practices in Canadian Municipal Sustainable Purchasing](#); Prepared by Reeve Consulting, December 2010.

^{iv} Information taken from: [Municipal Collaboration for Sustainable Purchasing - Trends and Best Practices in Canadian Municipal Sustainable Purchasing](#); Prepared by Reeve Consulting, December 2010.

^v Information taken from: [Municipal Collaboration for Sustainable Purchasing - Trends and Best Practices in Canadian Municipal Sustainable Purchasing](#); Prepared by Reeve Consulting, December 2010.

^{vi} Information taken from: [Municipal Collaboration for Sustainable Purchasing - Trends and Best Practices in Canadian Municipal Sustainable Purchasing](#); Prepared by Reeve Consulting, December 2010.

^{vii} Information taken from: [Municipal Collaboration for Sustainable Purchasing - Trends and Best Practices in Canadian Municipal Sustainable Purchasing](#); Prepared by Reeve Consulting, December 2010.

^{viii} Information taken from: [Municipal Collaboration for Sustainable Purchasing - Trends and Best Practices in Canadian Municipal Sustainable Purchasing](#); Prepared by Reeve Consulting, December 2010.



^{ix} Information taken from: Municipal Collaboration for Sustainable Purchasing - Trends and Best Practices in Canadian Municipal Sustainable Purchasing: Prepared by Reeve Consulting, December 2010.

^x Information taken from: Municipal Collaboration for Sustainable Purchasing - Trends and Best Practices in Canadian Municipal Sustainable Purchasing: Prepared by Reeve Consulting, December 2010.

^{xi} Information taken from: Municipal Collaboration for Sustainable Purchasing - Trends and Best Practices in Canadian Municipal Sustainable Purchasing: Prepared by Reeve Consulting, December 2010.